

LIVERMORE AREA RECREATION AND PARK DISTRICT

PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

MINUTES

**Tuesday, October 10, 2023
3:00 p.m.**

**Robert Livermore Community Center
4444 East Avenue, Livermore, CA 94550-5053
West Wing Conference Room**

Committee Members Present: James Boswell, Maryalice Faltings
(alternate for Jan Palajac who was on vacation.)

Staff Present: Mat Fuzie, Jill Kirk, Michelle Kleman, Amber Maugeri,
Linda VanBuskirk

Members of the Public Present: None

- 1. CALL TO ORDER:** Committee Chair Boswell called the meeting to order at 3:01 p.m.
- 2. PUBLIC COMMENT:** Chair Boswell opened the Public Comment period. As no members of the public were present, there were no public comments. Chair Boswell closed the Public Comment period.
- 3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE PERSONNEL COMMITTEE HELD ON SEPTEMBER 12, 2023:** The minutes of the Personnel Committee held on September 12, 2023 were approved unanimously as submitted.
- 4. TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY – PROCESS, TIMING AND POTENTIAL OUTCOMES:** Human Resources Manager (HRM) Michelle Kleman and Senior Human Resources Analyst (SHRA) Amber Maugeri gave a presentation to the Personnel Committee regarding the 2023 Total Compensation Study with Business Partner: Koff & Associates. (The presentation is included as an attachment to these minutes.) General Manager (GM) Mat Fuzie emphasized that the study is crucial due to rising benefit costs and the need to maintain the organization's viability. This study aims to assess the value proposition offered to employees, including benefits and wages. It is essential to understand why people choose to work for the District and how it compares to other agencies. This information will help the Board make informed decisions about potential adjustments in the future.

Key points highlighted in the presentation included the differences between the last compensation study, completed in 2018, and the current study. Notably, the elimination of 38-hour part-time employees made it easier to find comparable agencies for the study. GM Fuzie added that making that change was the basis for the latest decision by ACERA to make LARPD an exception in the pension world. He stressed that this was a Board success. HRM Kleman agreed that was good groundwork that the District laid.

The presentation also outlined the first steps, which involve benchmarking key positions, providing current class descriptions, and working with consultant Koff & Associates to identify approximately 12 comparator agencies. The presentation highlighted various benchmark positions across different departments, and focused on the importance of assessing and benchmarking compensation and benefits to ensure the organization remains competitive and attractive to employees.

Looking Ahead: The desired outcome of the study is to formalize a total compensation philosophy for the District as it moves forward with the 2023 Total Compensation Study.

Committee Comments and Questions:

Chair Boswell inquired about the degree of overlap with comparator agencies, and it was discussed that the City of Pleasanton matches LARPD the closest. The discussion also touched on the pros and cons of unions and noted that LARPD is not unionized.

Director Faltings raised questions about what specific aspects are being compared among the selected entities. The presentation emphasized the importance of attracting job applicants and retaining current employees.

Director Faltings stated that the Greater Vallejo Recreation District used to be a hybrid, part special district and part of the City of Vallejo.

- HRM Kleman will look into whether this is still their structure.

It was mentioned that we will use the Economic Research Institute (ERI) to benchmark Youth Services.

- Community Services Manager (CSM) Jill Kirk suggested using data from YMCA, the Dublin EDCC, or the Pleasanton School District as they provide a good example of what LARPD does, including preschool, on school sites/government properties. Chair Boswell mentioned that school districts running after-school care, or the National Education Association could be valuable in providing comparative data. The presentation noted that 12 comparator agencies have been contracted, and ERI is taking one of those slots, with the option to rearrange them if necessary.

ACTION:

- The Committee expressed approval of the comparator agencies presented, with suggestions as outlined above, and agreed that staff should move forward with the 2023 Total Compensation Survey.
- GM Fuzie asked staff to
 - 1) use a dark font against a light background for easy viewing, and
 - 2) use a larger font.

5. DIRECTORS' AND/OR GENERAL MANAGER'S REPORTS OR ANNOUNCEMENTS:
There were no reports or announcements from the Directors or the General Manager.

6. ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:42 p.m.

/Lvb



2023 Total Compensation Study

Business Partner:
Koff & Associates

Differences between 2018 and now

- ◇ Challenges from the compensation study done in 2018
 - ◇ The District had 38-hour per week employees classified as “part time” along with 20 hours or less employees. This impacted the comparison, as the agency had to compare class descriptions to full time jobs at other agencies, but then compare pay and benefits against part time rates.
 - ◇ The District had a different benefits philosophy regarding part time employees, where the District contribution was less for part time benefited employees than for full time/regular employees. The study highlighted discrepancies when the District had two or more employees with the same class description, but one at 38 hours and the other at 40 receiving very different benefit packages.
- ◇ 2023
 - ◇ Since the last study, the District has eliminated the 38-hour per week part time employee type.
 - ◇ In 2022, the medical and dental contributions were equalized for all full time/regular and part time benefited employees.



Unique Offerings at LARPD

Our Special District offers the community a wide array of programs that are not always comparable to other agencies that we may think we align to. The goal of this 2023 study is to find the best data possible from a variety of sources to be as comprehensive as possible. For this reason, our Youth Services department will be segmented out and analyzed separately.

First Steps



Benchmark Key Positions

Establish a list of 40 positions within the District that we would like to evaluate.



Provide Current Class Descriptions

Along with general District data, we need to provide accurate class descriptions for all the benchmark positions.



Comparator Agencies

Work with Koff & Associates to determine approximately 12 comparator agencies to use for this study.

Benchmark Positions for Administration

ADMINISTRATION

- General Manager
- Executive Assistant to the General Manager
- Business Services Manager
- Front Office Coordinator
- Administrative Assistant
- Administrative Aide*
- Senior Office Assistant*
- Office Assistant

ACCOUNTING & FINANCE

- Finance Officer
- Financial Analyst
- Accountant
- Procurement and Contract Specialist*
- Payroll Technician
- Accounting Assistant*

HUMAN RESOURCES

- Human Resources Manager
- Senior Human Resources Analyst

*Positions listed with an asterisk will not be benchmarked, but are listed to show placement within current job families

Benchmark Positions for Community Services (Excluding Youth Services)

COMMUNITY SERVICES

- Community Services Manager

COMMUNITY OUTREACH

- Community Outreach Supervisor
- Community Outreach Coordinator

OPEN SPACE

- Field Supervising Ranger
- Open Space Interpreter
- Natural Resources Technician
- Park Ranger Lead*
- Park Ranger
- Naturalist
- Park Ranger Aide*

*Positions listed with an asterisk will not be benchmarked, but are listed to show placement within current job families

Benchmark Positions for Parks & Facilities

PARKS & FACILITIES

- Parks and Facilities Manager

FACILITY MAINTENANCE

- Pool Maintenance Specialist
- Senior Facility Maintenance Technician

PARK MAINTENANCE

- Park Supervisor
- Field Supervisor
- Park Foreman*
- Mechanic
- Park Maintenance Technician II
- Park Maintenance Technician I*

*Positions listed with an asterisk will not be benchmarked, but are listed to show placement within current job families

Benchmark Positions for Recreation

RECREATION

- Recreation Supervisor
- Coordinator II
- Recreation Coordinator
- Recreation Leader III*
- Recreation Leader II
- Recreation Leader I*

AQUATICS

- Aquatics Coordinator
- Aquatics Lead
- Lifeguard II
- Lifeguard I*

FACILITY OPERATIONS

- Senior Facility Attendant

*Positions listed with an asterisk will not be benchmarked, but are listed to show placement within current job families

Comparator Agencies*

City of Pleasanton

City of Walnut Creek

City of San Ramon

City of Dublin

Pleasant Hill Recreation and Park District

Conejo Recreation and Park District

Hayward Area Recreation and Park District

City of Tracy

City of Livermore

Desert Recreation District

Greater Vallejo Recreation District

*For all departments except Youth Services

How were the Comparator Agencies determined?

The comparator agency analysis includes specific data for each proposed agency:

- ◆ Geographic Proximity
- ◆ Population
- ◆ Full-Time Equivalent Employees (FTE)
- ◆ Agency Financials (Expenditures)
- ◆ Cost of Living compared to Livermore, CA
- ◆ Comparable Services Provided



Benchmark Positions for Youth Services

Youth Services Administrator

Youth Services Coordinator

Enrollment Eligibility Specialist

Lead Teacher*

Teacher

Senior Program Leader*

Program Leader

*Positions listed with an asterisk will not be benchmarked, but are listed to show placement within current job families

How do we benchmark Youth Services?



Our Youth Services offerings align the closest with private sector programs



Private companies, such as preschools and after-school programs, are not obligated to provide salary data upon request like public agencies are



Economic Research Institute (ERI) is how we will benchmark these programs

ERI was founded over 25 years ago to provide compensation applications for private and public organizations. ERI compiles the most robust salary and cost-of-living survey data available with current market data for more than 1,000 industry sectors.

Looking Ahead

As we move forward with the 2023 Total Compensation Study, our desired outcome is to formalize a total compensation philosophy for the District.

We are interested in your thoughts!